



October 30, 2018

Sara Butler Goodwyn, Mills & Cawood Inc. 3310 West End Avenue Nashville,TN 37203 Re: **RFQ # 1039754, Design Services for the Stormwater Administrative Office Buildings** 

Dear Mrs. Butler:

The Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson County (Metro) has completed the evaluation of submitted solicitation offer(s) to the above RFQ # 1039754 for Design Services for the Stormwater Administrative Office Buildings. This letter hereby notifies you of Metro's intent to award to Goodwyn, Mills & Cawood Inc., contingent upon Mayoral approval and successful contract negotiations. Please provide a certificate of Insurance indicating all applicable coverages within 15 business days of the receipt of this letter.

If the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements were a part of this solicitation, the awardee must forward a signed copy of the "Letter of Intent to Perform as Subcontractor/Subconsultant/Supplier/Joint Venture" for any minority/women-owned business enterprises included in the response to the Business Assistance Office within two business days from this notification.

Additionally the awardee will be required to submit evidence of participation of and contractor's payment to all Small, Minority, and Women Owned Businesses participation in any resultant contract. This evidence shall be submitted monthly and include copies of subcontracts or purchase orders, the Prime Contractor's Application for Payment, or invoices, and cancelled checks or other supporting payment documents. Should you have any questions concerning this requirement, please contact Jeremy Frye, BAO Representative, at (615) 862-6638 or at jeremy.frye@nashville.gov.

Depending on the file sizes, the responses to the procurement solicitation and supporting award documentation can be made available either by email, CD for pickup, or in person for inspection. If you desire to receive or review the documentation or have any questions, please contact Brad Wall by email at brad.wall@nashville.gov Monday through Friday between 8:30am and 3:30pm.

Thank you for participating in Metro's competitive procurement process.

Sincerely,

hichelle . Aerearder Land

Michelle A. Hernandez Lane Purchasing Agent

Cc: Solicitation File, Other Offerors

#### Pursuant to M.C.L. 4.36.010 Authority to resolve protested solicitations and awards.

**A. Right to Protest.** Any actual or prospective bidder, offeror or contractor who is aggrieved in connection with the solicitation or award of a contract may protest to the Purchasing Agent. The protest shall be submitted in writing within ten (10) days after such aggrieved person knows or should have known of the facts giving rise thereto.



# METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

# Request for Mayoral Selection of A&E Firm RFQ 1039754, Design Services for the Stormwater Administrative Office Buildings

Metro received five (5) proposals for the A&E Review Board to consider. The Review Board submits for review and selection by the Mayor the top three (3) evaluated firms listed below in alphabetical order, accompanied by the Review Board's summary.

While it is acknowledged that the selection is solely that of the Mayor, it is the Review Board's recommendation that **Goodwyn**, **Mills & Cawood Inc.** be considered for this project.

# A&E Firm: EOA Architects PLLC

- Strengths: The firm provided a detailed overview. The firm provided a detailed description of their knowledge and ability in designing multi-functional facilites into sophisticated specialized spaces. The firm provided a detailed organization chart of the key individuals and subcontractors that will be utilized in providing the services defined in the scope of work. The resumes of the key individuals associated with the scope of work were detailed. The firm provided detailed information identifying at least one (1) LEED Accredited Professional and a detailed description of the LEED Certified projects that were completed. The firm provided detailed information identifying at least two (2) members of the team that had completed at least three (3) Low Impact Design projects and a detailed description of those projects. The firm provided a detailed description of their approach to designing both phases of the project along with a detailed description of how they would manage Metro Water Service (MWS) employees who will be onsite. The firm provided a detailed Gantt chart. Expressed commitment to SBE/SDV participation. Mentioned the firm's commitment to prompt payments.Strategic approach, and reporting of SBE/SDV participation.
- Weaknesses: Three (3) of the reference projects submitted were not of similar size and scope. The firm's explanation of the scope of work and how it's related to the reference projects submitted lacked detail. An interior designer was not requested as part of the scope of work for this project. Efforts to ensure prompt pay lacked detail.
- MWBE Plan:Proposed the engagement of Hawkins Partners, Inc Landscaping Architecture<br/>(WBE), Geotek Engineering (MBE) Geotechnical engineering and Tolleson McCoy<br/>(WBE) graphic design.
- SBE/SDV Plan: Proposer acknowledged a 15% participation requirement of SBE/SDV over life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed to utilize the following SBE subcontractors: EMC Structual Engineering for structual engineering, Power Management Corp. for MEP engineering, and BuildingsGreened for Leed Certification.

A&E Firm: Strengths:

#### Goodwyn, Mills & Cawood Inc.

The firm provided a detailed overview. The firm provided a detailed description of their knowledge and ability in designing multi-functional facilites into sophisticated specialized spaces. All reference projects submitted were of similar size and scope. The firm provided a detailed explanation of the scope of work and how it's related to the reference projects submitted. The firm provided a detailed organization chart of the key individuals and subcontractors that will be utilized in providing the services defined in the scope of work. The resumes of the key individuals associated with the scope of work were detailed. The firm provided detailed information identifying at least one (1) LEED Accredited Professional and a detailed description of the LEED Certified projects that were completed. The firm provided detailed information identifying at least two (2) members of the team that had completed at least three (3) Low Impact Design projects and a detailed description of those projects. The firm provided a detailed description of their approach to designing both phases of the project along with a detailed description of how they would manage Metro Water Service (MWS) employees who will be onsite. The firm provided a detailed Gantt chart that was the most aggressive. Expressed commitment to SBE/SDV participation. Mentioned the firm's commitment to prompt payments.

- Weaknesses: An interior designer was not requested as part of the scope of work for this project. Approach to maximizing SBE/SDV lacked detail.
- MWBE Plan: Proposed the engagement of Dynamix Engineering (MBE) for mechanical engineering, Connico (WBE) cost consultant, and Win Engineering (WBE) for electrical engineering.
- SBE/SDV Plan: Proposer acknowledged a 15% participation requirement of SBE/SDV over life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed to utilize the following SBE subcontractors EMC Structual Engineering for structual engineering, Win Engineering for electrical engineering, BuildingsGreened for Leed Consultant, and Perry Engineering for civil engineering.

## A&E Firm: Tuck Hinton Architects

Strengths: The firm provided a detailed overview. The firm provided a detailed description of their knowledge and ability in designing multi-functional facilites into sophisticated specialized spaces. The firm provided a detailed explanation of the scope of work and how it's related to the reference projects submitted. The resumes of the key individuals associated with the scope of work were detailed. The firm provided detailed information identifying at least two (2) members of the team that had completed at least three (3) Low Impact Design projects and a detailed description of those projects. The firm provided a detailed Gantt chart. Expressed commitment to SBE/SDV participation. Mentioned the firm's commitment to prompt payments.

**Review Board's Summary Follows** 

- Weaknesses: Nine (9) of the reference projects submitted were not of similar size and scope. The firm's description of the LEED Certified projects that were completed by a LEED Accredited Professional lacked detail. The firm's organization chart lacked detail; specifically, a plumbing engineer was not identified. The firm's description of their approach to designing both phases of the project along with how they would manage Metro Water Service (MWS) employees who will be onsite lacked detail. The firm's overall plan lacked detail on project execution. Efforts to ensure prompt pay lacked detail. Strategic approach and reporting of SBE/SDV participation lacked detail.
- MWBE Plan: Proposed the engagement of Logan Patri (MBE) Structual Engineering, DF&H Services (WBE) MEP Engineering, and Connico (WBE) Estimating.
- SBE/SDV Plan: Proposer acknowledged a 15% participation requirement of SBE/SDV over life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed to utilize the following SBE subcontractors: Hodgson & Douglas, Logan Patri, DF&H Services, Connico, and Geotek.

www.Nashville.gov Phone: 615-862-6180 Fax: 615-862-6179

RFQ # 1039754 - Design Services for the Stormwater Administrative Office Buildings					
	EOA Architects PLLC	Goodwyn, Mills & Cawood Inc.	Hastings Architecture Associates, LLC	Moody Nolan, Inc.	Tuck Hinton Architects
Contract Acceptance	Accepted	Accepted	Accepted	Accepted	Accepted
Firm Qualifications and Experience (30 Points)	24.00	27.00	25.00	22.00	22.00
Team Qualifications (40 Points)	39.00	39.00	30.00	28.00	30.00
Business Plan & Project Schedule (25 points)	20.00	25.00	8.00	15.00	17.00
Small Business/Service Disable Veteran Owned					
Plan (5 Points)	2.88	2.25	2.25	2.50	2.38
Total (100 Points)	85.88	93.25	65.25	67.50	71.38

# EOA Architects PLLC

**Strengths** - The firm provided a detailed overview. The firm provided a detailed description of their knowledge and ability in designing multifunctional facilites into sophisticated specialized spaces. The firm provided a detailed organization chart of the key individuals and subcontractors that will be utilized in providing the services defined in the scope of work. The resumes of the key individuals associated with the scope of work were detailed. The firm provided detailed information identifying at least one (1) LEED Accredited Professional and a detailed description of the LEED Certified projects that were completed. The firm provided detailed information identifying at least two (2) members of the team that had completed at least three (3) Low Impact Design projects and a detailed description of those projects. The firm provided a detailed description of their approach to designing both phases of the project along with a detailed description of how they would manage Metro Water Service (MWS) employees who will be onsite. The firm provided a detailed Gantt chart. Expressed commitment to SBE/SDV participation. Mentioned the firm's commitment to prompt payments.Strategic approach, and reporting of SBE/SDV participation.

Weaknesses - Three (3) of the reference projects submitted were not of similar size and scope. The firm's explanation of the scope of work and how it's related to the reference projects submitted lacked detail. An interior designer was not requested as part of the scope of work for this project. Efforts to ensure prompt pay lacked detail.

## Goodwyn, Mills & Cawood Inc.

**Strengths** - The firm provided a detailed overview. The firm provided a detailed description of their knowledge and ability in designing multifunctional facilites into sophisticated specialized spaces. All reference projects submitted were of similar size and scope. The firm provided a detailed explanation of the scope of work and how it's related to the reference projects submitted. The firm provided a detailed organization chart of the key individuals and subcontractors that will be utilized in providing the services defined in the scope of work. The resumes of the key individuals associated with the scope of work were detailed. The firm provided detailed information identifying at least one (1) LEED Accredited Professional and a detailed description of the LEED Certified projects that were completed. The firm provided detailed information identifying at least two (2) members of the team that had completed at least three (3) Low Impact Design projects and a detailed description of how they would manage Metro Water Service (MWS) employees who will be onsite. The firm provided a detailed Gantt chart that was the most aggressive. Expressed commitment to SBE/SDV participation. Mentioned the firm's commitment to prompt payments.

Weaknesses - An interior designer was not requested as part of the scope of work for this project. Approach to maximizing SBE/SDV lacked detail.

## Hastings Architecture Associates, LLC

**Strengths** - The firm provided a detailed overview. The firm provided a detailed explanation of the scope of work and how it's related to the reference projects submitted. The resumes of the key individuals associated with the scope of work were detailed. The firm provided detailed information identifying at least two (2) members of the team that had completed at least three (3) Low Impact Design projects and a detailed description of those projects. Detailed Expressed commitment to SBE/SDV participation.

Weaknesses - The firm's description of their knowledge and ability in designing multi-functional facilites into sophisticated specialized spaces lacked detail. Three (3) of the reference projects submitted were not of similar size and scope. The firm's organization chart of the key individuals and subcontractors that will be utilized in providing the services defined in the scope of work lacked detail. The firm failed to describe the LEED Certified projects that were completed by a LEED Accredited Professional. The firm's description of their approach to designing both phases of the project along with how they would manage Metro Water Service (MWS) employees who will be onsite lacked detail. The firm's Gantt chart lacked specific details around the scheduling of the project. Lacked strategic approach to maximizing SBE/SDV.

# Moody Nolan, Inc.

Strengths - The firm provided a detailed overview. The firm provided a detailed description of their knowledge and ability in designing multifunctional facilites into sophisticated specialized spaces. The firm provided detailed information identifying at least one (1) LEED Accredited Professional and a detailed description of the LEED Certified projects that were completed. The firm provided detailed information identifying at least two (2) members of the team that had completed at least three (3) Low Impact Design projects and a detailed description of those projects. The firm provided a detailed Gantt chart. Detailed Expressed commitment to SBE/SDV participation.

Weaknesses - Five (5) of the reference projects submitted were not of similar size and scope. The firm's explanation of the scope of work and how it's related to the reference projects submitted lacked detail. The firm's organization chart of the key individuals and subcontractors that will be utilized in providing the services defined in the scope of work lacked detail. An interior designer was not requested as part of the scope of work for this project. Efforts to ensure prompt pay were not addressed.

# **Tuck Hinton Architects**

**Strengths** - The firm provided a detailed overview. The firm provided a detailed description of their knowledge and ability in designing multifunctional facilites into sophisticated specialized spaces. The firm provided a detailed explanation of the scope of work and how it's related to the reference projects submitted. The resumes of the key individuals associated with the scope of work were detailed. The firm provided detailed information identifying at least two (2) members of the team that had completed at least three (3) Low Impact Design projects and a detailed description of those projects. The firm provided a detailed Gantt chart. Expressed commitment to SBE/SDV participation. Mentioned the firm's commitment to prompt payments.

**Weaknesses** - Nine (9) of the reference projects submitted were not of similar size and scope. The firm's description of the LEED Certified projects that were completed by a LEED Accredited Professional lacked detail. The firm's organization chart lacked detail; specifically, a plumbing engineer was not identified. The firm's description of their approach to designing both phases of the project along with how they would manage Metro Water Service (MWS) employees who will be onsite lacked detail. The firm's overall plan lacked detail on project execution. Efforts to ensure prompt pay lacked detail. Strategic approach and reporting of SBE/SDV participation lacked detail.

# **PNP Compliance Results Form**

Department Name:Metro Water Services RFP/ITB Number: RFQ #1039754 Project Name:Design Services for the Stromwater Admistrative Office Building (A&E)		
Primary Contractor	PNP Compliant (Yes/No)	Determination Comments/% of Participation Proposed or Bid
Goodwyn, Mills & Cawood Inc.	Yes	Proposer is compliant with the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements having reached out to three certified MWBE firms as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed the engagement of Dynamix Engineering (MBE) for mechanical engineering,Connico (WBE) cost consultant, and Win Engineering (WBE) for electrical engineering. Consistent with the Procurement Code, actual dollar amounts will be confirmed upon contract award.
EOA Architects PLLC	Yes	Proposer is compliant with the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements having reached out to three certified MWBE firms as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed the engagement of Hawkins Partners,Inc Landscaping Architecture (WBE), Geotek Engineering (MBE) Geotechnical engineering, and Tolleson McCoy (WBE) graphic design. Consistent with the Procurement Code, actual dollar amounts will be confirmed upon contract award.

		Proposer is compliant with the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements having reached out to three certified MWBE firms as required by the	
		Procurement Code. Proposed the engagement of Logan Patri (MBE) Structual Engineering, DF&H Services (WBE)	
		MEP Engineering, and Connico (WBE) Estimating. Consistent with the Procurement Code, actual dollar	
Tuck Hinton	Yes	amounts will be confirmed upon contract award.	

Date:09/28/2018 Metro Buyer:Brad Wall BAO Rep: Jeremy Frye

E	BAO SBE As	ssessment Sheet
BAO Specialist: Jeremy Frye		
Contract Specialist: Brad Wall		
Date: 9/28/2018		
Department Name: Metro Water Serv	vices	
RFP/ITB Number: 1039754		-
Project Name:Design Services for th	e Strom Water Adm	instrative Office Building (A&E) (15% SBE/SDV Requirement)
Primary Contractor:	SBEs approved?	Comments
Goodwyn, Mills & Cawood Inc.	Yes	SBE/SDV Plan: Proposer acknowledged a 15% participation requirement of SBE/SDV over life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed to utilize the following SBE subcontractors <b>EMC</b> <b>Structual Engineering</b> for structual engineering, <b>Win Engineering</b> for electrical engineering , <b>BuildingsGreened</b> for Leed Consultant, and <b>Perry Engineering</b> for civil engineering.
EOA Architects PLLC	Yes	SBE/SDV Plan: Proposer acknowledged a15% participation requirement of SBE/SDV over life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed to utilize the following SBE subcontractors: <b>EMC</b> <b>Structual Engineering</b> for structual engineering, <b>Power Management Corp.</b> for MEP engineering, and <b>BuildingsGreened</b> for Leed Certification.
Tuck Hinton Architects	Yes	SBE/SDV Plan: Proposer acknowledged a15% participation requirement of SBE/SDV over life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed to utilize the following SBE subcontractors: <b>Hodgson &amp;</b> <b>Douglas, Logan Patri, DF&amp;H Services,</b> <b>Connico</b> ,and <b>Geotek</b> .